1	Ann M. Asiano (SBN: 094891) Sara Allman (SBN: 107932) Matthew T. Brand (SBN: 295377) CLARK HILL LLP			
2				
3	One Embarcadero Center, Suite 400 San Francisco, CA 94111			
4	Telephone: (415) 984-8500 Facsimile: (415) 984-8599			
5	AAsiano@clarkhill.com SAllman@clarkhill.com MBrand@clarkhill.com			
6				
7	Attorneys for Defendant City of Albany			
8	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT			
9	NORTHERN DISTRICT	OF CALIFORNIA		
10				
11	SWAMI SHRADDHANANDA SARASWATI, an individual	Case No. 3:17-CV-04940		
12	Plaintiff,	DEFENDANT CITY OF ALBANY'S		
13	vs.	ANSWER TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTIVE		
14	CITY OF BERKELEY, CITY OF ALBANY,	RELIEF AND DAMAGES		
15	PACIFIC GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY, a California registered domestic stock corporation,	Demand for Jury Trial		
16	FRANK L. YEE, MAY L. YEE, and DOES 1-100, Inclusive	Action Filed: August 24, 2017		
17	Defendants.			
18				
19				
20	Defendant CITY OF ALBANY (hereinafter "Defendant"), by and through its undersigned			
21	counsel, hereby Answers the Complaint filed by Plaintiff SWAMI SHRADDHANANDA			
22	SARASWATI, (hereinafter "Plaintiff") and each cause of action contained therein, as follows:			
23	1. Answering paragraph 1 of Plaintiff's C	Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient		
24	information or belief to enable it to answer the said pa	aragraph and, on that ground, denies each and		
25	every allegation contained therein.			
26	2. Answering paragraph 2 of Plaintiff's C	Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient		
27	information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and			
28	every allegation contained therein.			
	216355857.1 1  DEFENDANT CITY OF ALBANY'S ANSW	Case No. 3:17-CV-04940		
I	DEFENDANT CITT OF ALDANT 5 ANSW	ER TOTLAUTHE S COMELAUM		

- 3. Answering paragraph 3 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation and claim for relief contained therein.
- 4. Answering paragraph 4 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant admits that this Court currently has subject matter jurisdiction but denies any violations.
- 5. Answering paragraph 5 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant admits that venue is currently proper but denies any violations.
- 6. Answering paragraph 6 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained therein.
- 7. Answering paragraph 7 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained therein.
- 8. Answering paragraph 8 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.
- 9. Answering paragraph 9 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation and claim for relief contained therein.
- 10. Answering paragraph 10 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained therein.
- 11. Answering paragraph 11 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies every allegation contained herein.
- 12. Answering paragraph 12 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies every allegation contained herein.
- 13. Answering paragraph 13 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, 216355857.1

  2 Case No. 3:17-CV-04940

8

6

11

10

12 13

14

15 16

17

18

20

19

21 22

23

24 25

26 27

28

Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.

- 14. Answering paragraph 14 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- Answering paragraph 15 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies every allegation 15. contained herein.
- 16. Answering paragraph 16 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies every allegation contained herein.
- 17. Answering paragraph 17 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained herein.
- 18. Answering paragraph 18 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant admits the allegations contained therein pertaining to this Defendant.
- 19. Answering paragraph 19 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 20. Answering paragraph 20 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 21. Answering paragraph 21 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 22. Answering paragraph 22 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 23. Answering paragraph 23 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.

Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.

28

216355857.1

Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.			
	31.	Answering paragraph 31 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient	
inform	ation or	belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and	
every allegation contained herein.			
	32.	Answering paragraph 32 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies every allegation	
contained herein.			
	33.	Answering paragraph 33 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against	
this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary,			

Case No. 3:17-CV-04940

- 35. Answering paragraph 35 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 36. Answering paragraph 36 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 37. Answering paragraph 37 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 38. Answering paragraph 38 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 39. Answering paragraph 39 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 40. Answering paragraph 40 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant hereby incorporates paragraphs 1 through 39 of this Second Claim, as though fully set forth herein.
- 41. Answering paragraph 41 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 42. Answering paragraph 42 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 43. Answering paragraph 43 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 44. Answering paragraph 44 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 45. Answering paragraph 45 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant hereby incorporates paragraphs 1 through 44 of this Third Claim, as though fully set forth herein.
- 46. Answering paragraph 46 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.

216355857.1 5 Case No. 3:17-CV-04940

- 47. Answering paragraph 47 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 48. Answering paragraph 48 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.
- 49. Answering paragraph 49 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 50. Answering paragraph 50 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 51. Answering paragraph 51 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 52. Answering paragraph 52 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 53. Answering paragraph 53 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 54. Answering paragraph 54 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 55. Answering paragraph 55 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant hereby incorporates paragraphs 1 through 54 of this Fourth Claim, as though fully set forth herein.
- 56. Answering paragraph 56 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.
- 57. Answering paragraph 57 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 58. Answering paragraph 58 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.

- 59. Answering paragraph 59 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 60. Answering paragraph 60 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 61. Answering paragraph 61 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 62. Answering paragraph 62 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant hereby incorporates paragraphs 1 through 61 of this Fourth Claim, as though fully set forth herein.
- 63. Answering paragraph 63 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.
- 64. Answering paragraph 64 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.
- 65. Answering paragraph 65 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.
- 66. Answering paragraph 66 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 67. Answering paragraph 67 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 68. Answering paragraph 68 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.

- 69. Answering paragraph 69 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.
- 70. Answering paragraph 70 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 71. Answering paragraph 71 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 72. Answering paragraph 72 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 73. Answering paragraph 73 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 74. Answering paragraph 74 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant hereby incorporates paragraphs 1 through 73 of this Fourth Claim, as though fully set forth herein.
- 75. Answering paragraph 75 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 76. Answering paragraph 76 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.
- 77. Answering paragraph 77 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.
- 78. Answering paragraph 78 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 79. Answering paragraph 79 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 80. Answering paragraph 80 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.

- 81. Answering paragraph 81 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 82. Answering paragraph 82 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 83. Answering paragraph 83 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 84. Answering paragraph 84 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 85. Answering paragraph 85 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 86. Answering paragraph 86 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 87. Answering paragraph 87 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 88. Answering paragraph 88 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 89. Answering paragraph 89 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 90. Answering paragraph 90 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 91. Answering paragraph 91 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 92. Answering paragraph 92 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 93. Answering paragraph 93 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.

- 94. Answering paragraph 94 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant does not have sufficient information or belief to enable it to answer the said paragraph and, on that ground, denies each and every allegation contained herein.
- 95. Answering paragraph 95 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 96. Answering paragraph 96 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 97. Answering paragraph 97 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- 98. Answering paragraph 98 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant hereby incorporates paragraphs 1 through 97 of this Fourth Claim, as though fully set forth herein.
- 99. Answering paragraph 99 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.
- 100. Answering paragraph 100 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.
- 101. Answering paragraph 101 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.
- 102. Answering paragraph 102 of Plaintiff's Complaint, it contains no allegations against this Defendant and no response is necessary. However, should a response be deemed necessary, Defendant denies every allegation contained therein.

## AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES

AS A FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to each and every claim for relief of the complaint, the Complaint fails to allege facts sufficient to state a claim upon which relief can be granted.

AS A SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to each and every claim for relief of the

Complaint, Plaintiff was partially, if not wholly, negligent or otherwise at fault on her own part and

Case No. 3:17-CV-04940

not limited to California Code of Civil Procedure §§340, 340.5, California Government Code §§ 905, 910, 911.2 and Code of Civil Procedure§ 335.1 and/or are barred to the extent provided in Federal Rules of Civil Procedure Rule 15.

AS A THIRTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that it is not liable for Plaintiff's allegations because it adheres to a self-evaluation plan and/or transition plan.

AS A FOURTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Plaintiff has not suffered any damages or incurred any response costs as a result of any acts or omissions of Defendant. Therefore, Plaintiff is barred from asserting any claims against Defendant.

AS A FIFTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that Plaintiff voluntarily and knowingly and/or impliedly assumed the risk or risks attendant to the matters complained about in the Complaint, completely barring, or proportionately reducing, Plaintiff's right of recovery herein if any there be.

AS A SIXTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that Plaintiff's actions against Defendant are not based on good faith, are frivolous, and entitle Defendant to an award of reasonable expenses and attorneys' fees.

AS A SEVENTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that the acts, omissions, and/or conduct of Defendant was not the proximate cause of the losses, damages and/or injuries, if any, as alleged in Plaintiff's Complaint and which herein are denied.

AS AN EIGHTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that the injuries, losses and damages, if any, as alleged in Plaintiff's Complaint and which herein are denied, were not caused by any act omission or conduct by Defendant, but were caused by some other act, omission, party or conduct over which Defendant exercised no supervision, control, and/or ownership of the subject property and for which it was not responsible.

AS A NINETEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of th
Complaint, Defendant alleges that Plaintiff was not by reason of a disability denied the benefits of
the services, programs or activities of this Defendant and thus her claims for discrimination herein
against this Defendant are barred.

AS A TWENTIETH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE TO THE COMPLAINT, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that Plaintiff has failed to join all necessary and indispensable parties to this action that may have contributed and/or caused the alleged fall on December 19, 2016.

AS A TWENTY-FIRST, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that the acts and/or omissions, if any, of this Defendant were not the proximate cause of the losses, damages, and/or injuries, if any, resulting from the alleged fall on December 19, 2016.

AS A TWENTY-SECOND, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges the injuries, losses and damages allegedly sustained by Plaintiff as a result of the alleged fall on December 19, 2016, were not caused by any act or omission of this Defendant, but were caused by some other acts, process or event, including but not limited to the operation of nature, over which this Defendant exercised no supervision and control, and for which it was not responsible.

AS A TWENTY-THIRD, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges if Plaintiff suffered any injuries and/or damages as a result of the alleged fall on December 19, 2016, which is denied, such injuries and/or damages were and are the sole and proximate result of an unavoidable accident and/or event.

AS A TWENTY-FOURTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges, without admitting any liability whatsoever, that Defendant had no notice, either actual or constructive, at any time relevant herein of any dangerous, hazardous or defective condition located on a portion of the sidewalk at or near 1577 Solano Avenue, California, as stated in the Complaint (California Government Code § 835.2)

216355857.1 13 Case No. 3:17-CV-04940

8

13

11

14 15

17

16

18 19

20 21

22

23 24

26

25

27 28

216355857.1

near 1577 Solano Avenue, California, were either wholly or in part, negligently caused by persons, firms, corporations or entities other than Defendant, and said negligence comparatively reduces the Case No. 3:17-CV-04940

AS A TWENTY-FIFTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that Plaintiff, while being pushed in a wheelchair down the portion of the sidewalk at or near 1577 Solano Avenue, California, was careless and negligent in and about the matters alleged in the Complaint, and that said carelessness and negligence on Plaintiff's own part proximately contributed to the happening of the incident and to the injuries, loss and damages complained of, if any they were, and said negligence on the part of the Plaintiff shall diminish and/or bar any recovery herein in direct proportion to the extent of such negligence under the doctrine of comparative negligence and/or contributory negligence.

AS A TWENTY-SIXTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that prior to and at the time of the occurrence of the alleged fall which is the subject of the Complaint, Plaintiff had knowledge of those matters alleged in the Complaint, that Plaintiff did, with the above-mentioned knowledge voluntarily and of her own free will, place herself in an unsafe and dangerous position on December 19, 2016, and by reason thereof, said Plaintiff had assumed the risk and all risks ordinarily incident thereto; and said assumption of risk bars recovery herein.

AS A TWENTY-SEVENTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that Plaintiff failed to mitigate her alleged damages resulting from the alleged fall, as required by law.

AS A TWENTY-EIGHTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that if there is any negligence or liability of any of the parties named herein as it related to the alleged fall, it is the sole and exclusive negligence of other defendants, whether named or unnamed, and not of this Defendant.

AS A TWENTY-NINTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to

Complaint sustained by Plaintiff, if any, as a result of alleged fall on the portion of the sidewalk at or

each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that damages alleged in the

 percentage of negligence, if any, by this Defendant under the doctrine of comparative negligence or comparative fault and/or based upon the doctrines of equitable indemnity and contribution.

AS A THIRTIETH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges, without admitting liability or that Plaintiff has suffered or will suffer any loss, damage or injury, in the alternative, that any loss, damage or injury which Plaintiff has suffered or will suffer as a result of the alleged fall stated in the Complaint or otherwise, is the direct and proximate result of the unforeseen/unforeseeable negligent, grossly negligent or criminal acts or omissions of an intervening third party or parties, or other acts or omissions for which such party or parties may be strictly liable, and that such acts or omissions constitute independent, intervening, and superseding cause of the Plaintiff's alleged injuries, and completely bar any recovery against Defendant.

AS A THIRTY-FIRST, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that Code of Civil Procedure § 1431.1, et seq., limits general damages and abates joint and several liability. Defendant requests that the Court apportion the damages, if any, and require Defendant to pay only its fair and legal percentage of liability as determined by the trier of fact and/or law.

AS A THIRTY-SECOND, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that it is entitled to recover reasonable expenses including, but not limited to, attorneys' fees and costs from Plaintiff and her counsel in that the Complaint on file herein is frivolous and was brought and maintained without reasonable cause and in bad faith, and therefore is totally and completely without merit. (Code of Civil Procedure §§ 128.5, 128.7, 1021.7, and 1038.)

AS A THIRTY-THIRD, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that this Complaint is barred by the doctrine of laches, estoppel, waiver, or unclean hands.

AS A THIRTY-FOURTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that the Complaint is barred by reason of the fact that Defendant is immune from prosecution under the claims and for the acts

216355857.1

15

Case No. 3:17-CV-04940

8

11

10

12 13

14 15

16 17

18

20

19

21 22

23 24

25

26

27 28 alleged by virtue of California Government Code § 800, et seq., and more particularly but not limited to §§ 815, 815.2, 815.4, 815.6, 818, 818.6, 818.8, 820.2, 820.4, 820.6, 820.8, 821, 821.4, 821.6, 821.8, and 835, et seq., and by virtue of California Government Code § 900, et seq.

AS A THIRTY-FIFTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that the Complaint is barred in its entirety based upon the immunities set forth in Code of Civil Procedure § 846, as well as California Government Code §§ 831.4 and 831.7, all pertaining to Plaintiff's recreational use of the recreational sidewalk on December 19, 2016 and, therefore, Plaintiff is not entitled to any relief whatsoever.

AS A THIRTY-SIXTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that Plaintiff's claims are barred against Defendant pursuant to the principles of Sovereign Immunity, including but not limited to Amendment XI of the United States Constitution.

AS A THIRTY-SEVENTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that there is no liability for any injury or damages, if any there were, for failure to inspect or for the negligent inspection of the portion of the sidewalk at or near 1577 Solano Avenue, California, which is owned and/or controlled by a third party. (California Government Code §§ 818.6, 821.4, 830.6)

AS A THIRTY-EIGHTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that Plaintiff's claim is barred in that the injuries and damages, if any, sustained by the Plaintiff as a result of the alleged fall while being pushed in a wheelchair down the portion of the sidewalk at or near 1577 Solano Avenue, were a direct and proximate result of the acts, omissions or negligence of third parties not within the knowledge or control of this Defendant, and were sustained, if at all, without any negligence or wrongful act or omission on the part of this Defendant. (California Government Code § 820.8.)

AS A THIRTY-NINTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Defendant alleges that at all times relevant to this litigation, the Plaintiff's injuries or damages were merely caused by the adoption or failing to adopt an enactment or by failing to enforce a law or enactment as it relates to maintenance, repair, and warnings of the Case No. 3:17-CV-04940 216355857.1

portion of the sidewalk at or near 1577 Solano Avenue, California, thereby precluding the Plaintiff from recovering from Defendant. (California Government Code § 818.2.)

AS A FORTIETH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that at all times relevant to this litigation, this Defendant acted in good faith, without malice, as it relates to the warning, maintenance, and repair of the portion of the sidewalk at or near 1577 Solano Avenue, California, and under the apparent authority of an enactment thereby precluding Plaintiff from recovering from this Defendant. (California Government Code § 820.6.)

AS A FORTY-FIRST, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges to the extent Plaintiff's damages or injuries resulting from the alleged fall were caused by a natural weather condition, Plaintiff is precluded from recovering from this Defendant. (California Government Code § 831.)

AS A FORTY-SECOND, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges to the extent Plaintiff's damages or injuries as a result of the fall were caused by a natural condition, Plaintiff is precluded from recovering from this Defendant. (California Government Code § 831.2.)

AS A FORTY-THIRD, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges its conduct, if any, which allegedly created the condition of the portion of the sidewalk at or near 1577 Solano Avenue, California, was reasonable, and therefore, Plaintiff is precluded from recovering from this Defendant. (California Government Code § 835.4.)

AS A FORTY-FOURTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that pursuant to City ordinances, maintenance and liability in the area of the sidewalk at or near 1577 Solano Avenue, California, where the Plaintiff's accident allegedly occurred, was the responsibility of the neighboring property owner and/or named or non-named parties.

AS A FORTY-FIFTH, SEPARATE AND FURTHER AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, to each and every claim for relief of the Complaint, Defendant alleges that the condition in question located 216355857.1 17 Case No. 3:17-CV-04940

1 on the portion of the sidewalk at or near 1577 Solano Avenue, California, where the Plaintiff's 2 accident allegedly occurred, was of such a minor, trivial, or insignificant nature in view of the 3 surrounding circumstances that no reasonable person would conclude that the condition created a substantial risk of injury. (California Government Code § 830.2.) 4 Defendant alleges, without admitting any liability whatsoever, that Defendant has insufficient 5 knowledge or information on which to form a belief as to whether Defendant may have additional, 6 7 as yet unstated, defenses available. Defendant reserves herein the right to assert additional defenses 8 in the event discovery indicates that they would be appropriate. 9 **DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL** 10 Defendant hereby demands a jury trial, as provided by Rule 38(a) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. 11 12 PRAYER FOR RELIEF 13 WHEREFORE, Defendant prays for judgment as follows: 14 1. That judgment is entered in favor of Defendant and against Plaintiff on all claims; 2. That Plaintiff take nothing by way of this Complaint; 15 3. For attorneys' fees as allowed by statute; 16 4. For costs of suit incurred herein; and 17 18 5. For such other and further relief as the court may deem just and proper. 19 20 Date: October 26, 2017 CLARK HILL LLP 21 By: /s/ Ann M. Asiano 22 SARA ALLMAN 23 MATTHEW T. BRAND Attorneys For Defendant 24 CITY OF ALBANY 25 26 27

28

216355857.1